

293836



Comparison of SARS-CoV-2 serologic assays: Architect, LIAISON, Wantai, EDI, Orient Gene

(10)(2e)

(10)(2e)

(10)(2e)

(10)(2e)



2020-05-07

Clinical Microbiological Laboratory
Department of Medical Microbiology
LUMC, the Netherlands



Methods

ELISAs:

- Architect IgG
- LIAISON IgG
- Wantai Ig and IgM
- EDI IgG ELISA

Rapid test:

- Orient Gene IgG/IgM

293836

Serum panel (N=36)

COVID-19 patients:	n=12
Convalescent sera (>/=7d)	
hospitalized patients (severe)	
ambulant patients (milder)	
Acute symptomatic (<7 d)	Unavailable
Negative controls:	n=24
CoV NL63, HKU1 and RSV positive	
Rheumafactor, EBV and CMV IgM positive	
Sera from 2018	

293836

Results: COVID-19 patients

				Architect SARS-CoV-2 IgG	Diasorin LIAISON IgG	Wantai SARS-CoV-2 AbT, IgM		EDI Novel Coronavirus COVID-19 IgG, IgM		Orient Gene snelftest COVID-19 IgG, IgM	
Panel	Days after onset symptoms	Index Serum timing vs PCR	IgG	AU/ml	IgG	Ig (total)	IgM	IgG	IgM	IgG	IgM
COVI D-19 panel											
1	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	23	2d after pos pcr, 1st IC day	7,15	pos	35,1 pos	18,53 / pos	7,06 / pos	4,09 / pos	7,30 / pos	pos
2	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	21	0d after pos pcr, 1st IC day	5,01	pos	14,4 grens	18,53 / pos	2,40 / pos	3,66 / pos	4,96 / pos	pos
3	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	8	-	1,68	pos	<3,8 neg	8,69 / pos	3,19 / pos	2,96 / pos	2,69 / pos	neg
4	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	16	1d after pos pcr	-	-	19,7 pos	18,53 / pos	11,62 / pos	0,41 / neg	0,55 / neg	pos
5	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	7	4d after pos pcr	4,83	pos	17,6 pos	18,53 / pos	11,62 / pos	2,67 / pos	1,84 / pos	pos
6	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	14	9d after pos pcr	4,19	pos	26 pos	0,84 / neg	11,62 / pos	3,63 / pos	1,70 / pos	pos
7	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	9	2d after pos pcr	0,08	neg	<3,80 neg	3,43 / pos	0,30 / neg	0,19 / neg	0,48 / neg	Borderline
8	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	9	1d after pos pcr	0,13	neg	<3,80 neg	7,62 / pos	0,79 / neg	0,97 / grens	0,58 / neg	borderline
9	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, hospitalized	10	2d after pos pcr	0,52	neg	<3,80 neg	14,84 / pos	1,85 / pos	1,07 / grens	0,52 / neg	Pos
10	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, ambulant	12	0d after pos pcr	-	-	-	Pos	Pos	-	-	Neg
11	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, ambulant	7	0d after pos pcr	-	-	-	Pos	Pos	-	-	Pos
12	SARS-CoV-2 PCR+, ambulant	14	(onset 14d)	5,17	pos	-	pos	pos	-	-	pos

Results: negative panel

		Architect SARS-CoV-2 IgG	Diasorin LIAISON IgG	Wantai SARS-CoV-2 AbI, IgM	EDI Novel Coronavirus COVID-19 IgG, IgM	Orient Gene sneltest COVID-19 IgG, IgM					
	Panel	Index	IgG	AU/ml	IgG	Ig (Total)	IgM	IgG	IgM		
13	NL63 PCR+	0,01	neg	9,92	neg	0,05 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,22 / neg	0,36 / neg	neg	borderline
14	NL63, RV PCR+	0,01	neg	9,58	neg	0,08 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,212 / neg	0,37 / neg	neg	neg
15	HKU1 PCR+	0,01	neg	<3,80	neg	0,03 / neg	0,03 / neg	0,21 / neg	0,33 / neg	neg	neg
16	HKU1 PCR+	0,06	neg	8,15	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,43 / neg	0,36 / neg	neg	neg
17	RSVP PCR+	0,04	neg	7,55	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,72 / neg	0,38 / neg	neg	neg
18	HKU1 PCR+	0,03	neg	4,4	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,20 / neg	0,58 / neg	neg	neg
19	Rheumafactor+	-	-	-	-	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,24 / neg	0,43 / neg	neg	neg
20	Rheumafactor+	-	-	-	-	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,68 / neg	borderline	neg	neg
21	Rheumafactor+	-	-	-	-	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,48 / neg	0,35 / neg	neg	neg
22	Rheumafactor+	-	-	-	-	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,28 / neg	0,37 / neg	-	-
23	Rheumafactor+	-	-	-	-	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	1,04 / green	0,45 / neg	-	-
24	EBV IgM+	0,08	neg	6,32	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,57 / neg	0,40 / neg	neg	neg
25	EBV IgM+	0,03	neg	4,66	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,46 / neg	0,43 / neg	neg	neg
26	EBV IgM+	0,05	neg	<3,80	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,57 / neg	0,34 / neg	neg	neg
27	EBV IgM+	0,04	neg	4,18	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,52 / neg	0,40 / neg	neg	neg
28	EBV IgM+	0,12	neg	4,97	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,65 / neg	0,38 / neg	neg	neg
29	NC serum uit 2018	0,03	neg	6,35	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,64 / neg	0,34 / neg	neg	neg
30	NC serum uit 2018	0,06	neg	4,16	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,52 / neg	0,45 / neg	neg	neg
31	NC serum uit 2018	0,06	neg	24,2	pos	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,67 / neg	0,45 / neg	neg	neg
32	NC serum uit 2018	0,06	neg	5,1	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	borderline	0,34 / neg	-	-
33	NC serum uit 2018	0,04	neg	610	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,69 / neg	0,37 / neg	-	-
34	NC serum uit 2018	0,03	neg	<3,80	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,36 / neg	0,41 / neg	-	-
35	NC serum uit 2018	0,03	neg	<3,80	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,66 / neg	0,36 / neg	-	-
36	NC serum uit 2018	0,03	neg	4,82	neg	0,03 / neg	0,02 / neg	0,43 / neg	0,39 / neg	-	-

293836

Sensitivity, specificity										
N=36		Architect IgG	LIAISON IgG	Wantai Ig	Wantai IgM	EDI IgG	EDI IgM	Orient Gene IgG	Orient Gene IgM	
Overall sensitivity N=12		6/9 (67%)	4/9 + 1 borderline (44% 56%)	11/12 (92%)	10/12 (83%)	5/9+2borderline (56-78%)	5/9 (56%)	8/12+2borderline (67-83%)	6/12+3borderline (50-75%)	
Sensitivity hospitalized patients N=9	Overall (onset 7-23d)	5/8 (63%)	4/9 + 1 borderline (44%-56%)	8/9 (89%)	7/9 (78%)	5/9+2borderline (56-78%)	5/9 (56%)	6/9+2borderline (67-89%)	4/9+3borderline (44-78%)	
	>14d	3/3 (100%)	% +1 borderline (75-100%)	% (75%)	4/4 (100%)	% (75%)	% (75%)	4/4 100%	%+1 borderline (75-100%)	
Sensitivity ambulant patients N=3	>=7d	1/1 (100%)	-	3/3 (100%)	3/3 (100%)	-	-	2/3 (67%)	2/3 (67%)	
Specificity N=24		19/19 (100%)	18/19 (95%)	24/24 (100%)	24/24 (100%)	22/24 (92%)	23/24 (96%)	17/17 (100%)	16/17 (94%)	

Conclusions and discussion

These data will be combined with the (Architect IgG) data from other laboratories (UMCG, ATAL-medial) to increase the numbers of sera tested. In particular additional data on the performance in the subcategories of patients in the earlier stages of the disease are needed.

When looking at the overall performance of the assays tested with in the current LUMC panel (this panel will be extended over time), the Wantai and Architect SARS-CoV-2 assays seem to have a combination of both higher sensitivity and specificity when compared to the other assays included